Original Article

Evidence for under-nutrition in adolescent females using routine dieting practices

Jade Guest MPH\(^1\), Ayse Bilgin PhD\(^2\), Robyn Pearce PhD\(^3\), Surinder Baines PhD\(^4\), Carol Zeuschner MSc\(^5\), Corilda Le Rossignol-Grant DipNursing\(^1\), Margaret J Morris PhD\(^6\), Ross Grant PhD\(^1,6\)

\(^1\)Australasian Research Institute, Sydney Adventist Hospital, NSW, Australia
\(^2\)Department of Statistics, Macquarie University, NSW, Australia
\(^3\)Faculty of Education, Avondale College, Cooranbong, NSW, Australia
\(^4\)School of Health Sciences, Faculty of Health, University of Newcastle, NSW, Australia
\(^5\)Department of Dietetics, Sydney Adventist Hospital, NSW, Australia
\(^6\)School of Medical Sciences, Faculty of Medicine, University of New South Wales, Sydney, NSW, Australia

In Western countries the increasing prevalence of obesity in young people is a major public health concern. While the focus has been on reducing obesity, paradoxically the success of these campaigns may result in unhealthy nutritional practices. The aim of this study was to investigate the use and impact of weight control techniques on the health of adolescent females. Using Analysis of Variance we compared physiological and biochemical markers of health against responses to a modified, Schools Physical Activity and Nutrition Survey (SPANS) in 482 adolescent females (14-17 yrs) from secondary schools in the northern Sydney and Central Coast regions of New South Wales, Australia. Participants who 'often' used weight control methods had, on average, a healthy BMI of 22.5 (SD=3.7). However, comparison of blood derived markers between participants who 'never', 'occasionally' or 'often' used weight reduction techniques showed that, those who 'often' used weight control methods had significantly lower haemoglobin (\(p<0.05\)), alkaline phosphatase (\(p<0.001\)), bilirubin (\(p<0.05\)), albumin (\(p<0.05\)), total protein (\(p<0.05\)), and calcium (\(p<0.05\)), but higher blood levels of creatinine (\(p<0.05\)) and potassium (\(p<0.05\)). These data suggest that the use of common weight control techniques by healthy weight adolescent females can produce a metabolically divergent group whose biochemical markers are consistent with subtle levels of chronic under-nutrition.

Key Words: adolescent, nutrition, diet fads, BMI, alkaline phosphatase

INTRODUCTION

In Western countries the increasing prevalence of obesity in young adults is a major public health concern due to its role in the pathophysiology of conditions such as metabolic syndrome and type 2 diabetes.\(^1,2\) While the focus has been on reducing obesity, paradoxically the success of these campaigns may result in the use of unhealthy nutritional practices. A number of studies conducted internationally have shown that a substantial percentage of healthy-weight adolescent females regard themselves as overweight.\(^3,5\) Considering oneself as overweight has been shown to correlate with low self esteem and body dissatisfaction.\(^6,7\) Body image perceptions are influenced by a number of factors, but have been consistently linked to the development of unrealistic ideals of beauty. Such ideals are readily integrated into the psyche due to widespread media portrayals, and may be amplified by the pressures and perception of family and peers.\(^8-11\) In order to reach the ideal standard of beauty, many adolescent females who are dissatisfied with their bodies commonly resort to the use of weight control techniques.\(^7,12-15\)

Weight control techniques reported to be employed by teenagers include dieting, excessive exercise and purging via either laxative misuse or vomiting, as well as the use of diet pills, cigarettes and caffeine.\(^4\) Abraham found that in an effort to control or reduce weight 48% of young Australian women restricted their food intake whilst 7% reported the use of self-induced vomiting, 2% reported laxative misuse and 15% reported excessive exercise. A further 14% reported smoking cigarettes or drinking coffee to control their weight.\(^3\) The practice of dieting, and other weight control techniques as described above may compromise the health of users and lead to eating disorders such as anorexia nervosa.\(^16\)

The physiological injury caused by the extreme malnutrition in disorders such as anorexia nervosa has been well documented.\(^17,22\) In such disorders most, if not all, body

Corresponding Author: Ross Grant, Australasian Research Institute, Sydney Adventist Hospital, 185 Fox Valley Rd, Wahroonga, NSW, 2076 Australia.
Tel: +612 94879602; Fax: +612 9487 9626
Email: rossg@sah.org.au
systems are adversely affected. However metabolic dysregulation may be occurring in individuals with more subtle levels of under-nutrition. Benzera et al. reported that persons on a carefully planned, energy controlled diet had a reduced intake of calcium, zinc, iron and vitamin E. Fogelholm et al. also showed that "yo-yo" dieting can cause adverse effects on bone density and mineralisation in premenopausal women. Turner et al. reported similar results, observing that adolescent females with a diet-related disorder were at risk of low bone density.

During adolescence when height should increase by approximately 25% and weight should almost double, the deprivation of essential nutrients may impact negatively upon sexual maturation, skeletal mineralisation and overall growth. Therefore a chronic reduction in overall energy and nutrient intake by adolescents is a potential cause for reduced cellular metabolism leading to growth impairment. This may occur even within the community’s normal spectrum of dieting practices. With evidence that eating patterns established in youth persist into adulthood, this presents a worrying trend for the high percentage of Australian adolescent females that report the use of weight control techniques.

Few studies have investigated the physiological/biochemical consequences of healthy weight females utilising weight control techniques, particularly in the Australian female adolescent population. This study therefore aimed to investigate the physiological health profile of a cohort of 14-17 year old females attending schools within the northern Sydney and Central Coast regions who self-reported regular use of weight control techniques.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Participants
As part of a wider diet and lifestyle study females aged 14-17 years were recruited from seven schools in the northern Sydney and Central Coast regions of Australia. This study was approved by the Sydney Adventist Hospital Human Research Ethics Committee (SAH HREC) number 04/07.

All subjects considered themselves to be in general good health at the time of the study. The total sample size for this study was 482.

Exclusions
Participants were not actively prevented from participating in the study. However on the basis of responses to the questionnaire, participants with diabetes or those on lipid or cholesterol lowering medications were excluded during data analysis.

Sample collection
Between 08:00am and 10:30am on the morning of the study, fasting blood samples were collected via normal venipuncture. Serum samples for biochemical analyses were stored at -80°C until analysis. Whole blood samples for haemoglobin and red cell quantitation were analysed within 4 hours of collection. All assays were performed by the pathology department at the Sydney Adventist Hospital using routine methods.

Height
Height was measured using a standard height bar after participants had removed their shoes.

Fat mass, muscle mass and weight
Fat mass, muscle mass and weight were measured using the Tanita Body Composition Analyser model BC420-MA. This system measures fat and muscle mass based on the principles of bioelectrical impedance, a validated measure of body composition.

Weight was measured to point one of a kilogram, with light clothing and no shoes. To account for clothing, 500 g was deducted from the weight of each participant.

Body mass index (BMI)
BMI was calculated using the standard formula of net weight in kg divided by the height in meters squared.

Waist circumference
The waist circumference of each participant was measured midway between the top of the ileac crest and the lowest rib using a standard tape measure.

Hip circumference
The hip circumference of each participant was measured around the largest portion of the buttocks using a standard tape measure.

Weight control behaviours
Self reports of weight control methods were obtained using a modified version of the Booth et al. NSW Schools Physical Activity and Nutrition Survey (SPANS). This survey contained specific questions relating to the use of weight control behaviours and body perception. The section of the SPANS survey relating to fundamental movement skill proficiency was not used.

Specific questions defining weight control behaviour included; ‘a) do you ever skip meals in order to lose weight; b) do you ever make yourself sick (vomit) in an attempt to manage your weight and c) how often do you diet; that is deliberately control how much you eat in order to keep your weight the same or lose weight?’

Statistical analysis
Comparisons between weight control technique groups were performed by using analysis of variance (ANOVA) and the Kruskal-Wallis test. Although 95% confidence intervals (CI) are only meaningful when a variable is normally distributed we have presented all the means and 95% CI for simplicity of the presentation regardless of whether tests were performed (Tables 3 and 4). For comparison of categorical variables chi-square tests were used. The statistical significance levels are reported as significant at the 5%, 1%, 0.1% and 0.01% (highly significant). Statistical analyses were performed using SPSS 16.0 for Windows.

RESULTS

Body perception
The majority of participants reported being ‘a fair bit’ or ‘very much’ happy with their weight (86%), body shape (91%) and fitness levels (91%) (Table 1).
Weight control behaviours
Of the 482 participants surveyed, 7% reported using self-induced vomiting to control or reduce their weight, with 1% of participants reporting their use of this technique as ‘often’. Dieting was practiced by 54% of participants, with 11% of participants reporting their use of this technique as ‘often’. 28% of participants surveyed reported skipping meals to control their weight, with 3% of participants using this weight control behaviour ‘often’.

Body perception and the use of weight control techniques
We found a significant association between body shape satisfaction and frequency of weight control method use (p<0.001). Forty percent (40%) of participants who were ‘a fair bit’ to ‘very much’ satisfied with their body shape reported using weight control methods. In comparison 77% of participants who were dissatisfied with their body shape reported using weight control methods. (Table 2)

We also observed a significant association between body weight satisfaction and frequency of use of weight control methods. Thirty nine percent (39%) of the participants who reported feeling ‘a fair bit’ to ‘very much’ satisfied with their weight reported using weight control methods compared to 79% of participants who were not satisfied with their body weight (p<0.001, Table 2).

No significant association was found between participant level of satisfaction with their fitness level and frequency of weight control method use (p=0.075).

BMI and body perception
The participants who were not satisfied with their body shape had a higher BMI (mean=23.6, SD=4.1) than participants who were ‘a little bit’ to ‘very much’ satisfied with their body shape and ‘often’. Differences in BMI between these categories were significant (p<0.001). Similar results were obtained for the satisfaction with weight categories where the average BMI declined from 24.3 (SD=4.1) to 21.8 (SD=3.3) and then 19.8 (SD=1.9) (p<0.001); and for the satisfaction with the fitness level categories where the average BMI declined from 23.1 (SD=4.5) to 21.8 (SD=3.5) and then 20.5 (SD=2.3) (p<0.001).

Morphological and physiological markers
Participants who ‘never’ used weight control methods had lower BMI, WHR, fat mass, muscle mass and fat to muscle ratio compared to the participants who used weight control methods ‘occasionally’ and ‘often’ (Table 3). There was considerable overlap between CI of those who used weight control methods ‘occasionally’ and ‘often’ (Table 3). The prevalence of overweight and obesity within this sample was 12.3% and 1.3% respectively based on the CDC 2000 BMI age specific percentile charts.

Blood derived health markers
To investigate the impact of weight control behaviours on biochemical health we looked at differences in blood derived health markers between those who ‘never’, ‘occasionally’ or ‘often’ used weight control techniques.

Participants who used weight control methods ‘often’ had significantly lower blood levels of haemoglobin, alkaline phosphatase (ALP), bilirubin, albumin, total protein and calcium, but higher blood levels of creatinine and potassium (Table 4). The largest differences were observed in ALP (95 IU/L for ‘often’ vs 124 IU/L for ‘never’) and bilirubin (9.7 μM for ‘often’ and 12.3 μM for ‘never’). Overlap was observed between confidence intervals (CI) of those who used weight control methods ‘occasionally’ and ‘often’.

DISCUSSION
In this study the average BMI of the sampled population was within the healthy range (16.8-24.8). However, those with higher BMI and fat/muscle ratios were more likely to be unhappy with their body shape or weight and more likely to use weight control techniques. This supports the observation by others that adolescent body weight perceptions do not coincide with actual weight or a healthy BMI. Striegel-Moore et al. proposed that

Table 1. Female adolescent participants reported degree of satisfaction with their own body weight, shape and fitness level

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Body satisfaction category</th>
<th>Weight (%)*</th>
<th>Body shape (%)**</th>
<th>Fitness (%)***</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not at all happy</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A little to somewhat happy</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fair bit to very happy</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The distribution of participants between all three categories of satisfaction (not at all happy, a little to somewhat happy and fair bit to very happy) is significantly different for weight (χ² = 89, df=2, *p<0.001), body shape (χ² = 129, df=2, **p<0.0001) and fitness (χ² = 171, df=2, ***p<0.0001).

Table 2. Comparison of body perception and the use of weight control methods

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Body perception category</th>
<th>Use of weight control methods (%)</th>
<th>Never</th>
<th>Occasionally</th>
<th>Often</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Body Shape *</td>
<td>Not at all happy</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A little to somewhat happy</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A fair bit to very happy</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not at all happy</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A little to somewhat happy</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A fair bit to very happy</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The association between all three satisfaction categories (not at all happy, a little to somewhat happy, and fair bit to very happy) and the use of weight control techniques is significantly different for weight (χ² = 58, df=4, **p<0.001) and body shape (χ² = 54, df=4, *p<0.001).
the reason for this misconception is that girls are being conditioned to equate underweight as normal weight.34

A unique finding of the present study was that participants who reported using common weight control techniques ‘often’ exhibited a biochemical health profile suggestive of chronic under nutrition.

Importantly we noted that confidence intervals for individual health markers in the ‘occasionally’ and ‘often’ weight control categories generally overlapped (Tables 3 and 4). Apart from creatinine and calcium all other variables were analysed using the Kruskal Wallis test. Therefore CIs for these dieting groups are not directly comparable.35 However clear differences were observable for selected parameters between the lowest use (never) and highest use (often) categories.

No difference was found for red cell count, mean red cell volume (data not shown), B12 and folate between dieting groups. However participants who frequently used weight control techniques had lower bilirubin, albumin and total protein (Table 4). As albumin is used commonly to assess adequate protein and nutrition this observation strongly suggests that the nutritional quality and quantity for this group is lower than that of their school peers who do not frequently diet.

Furthermore, those who reported using weight control methods ‘often’ also had reduced serum calcium and ALP levels.

ALP is a zinc dependant enzyme whose activity is consistently elevated during the adolescent years. The reduction in ALP activity may therefore reflect the reduced blood calcium and/or decreased zinc intake. Though blood zinc levels were not measured in this study, Gibson et al. noted that reduced zinc intake in adolescents may be due to a decline in red meat consumption.36 Indeed in this study a higher proportion of those who reported using weight control techniques ‘often’ also reported lower meat consumption (i.e. less than once a week); 13% vs 6% for those who ‘never’ use weight control methods. Weight loss studies have shown that low zinc intake may lead to a decrease in bone content and/or density.37-40 During adolescence, deprivation of essential elements such as calcium and zinc, may impact negatively upon skeletal mineralisation, possibly reducing growth potential and/or bone density.

In this study we have shown that high frequency dieting practices in the adolescent population can result in a subtle but significant reduction in important nutrients such as protein, calcium, iron, and potentially zinc. This chronic under-nutrition may lead to a reduction in key metabolic processes resulting in reduced bone mineralisation and growth potential. Consequently detrimental health effects may be occurring earlier in the weight loss spectrum than previously thought.13,37,41 Even though the blood results of those who ‘often’ used diet control measures fell within their age specific reference range, they do form an identifiable group that is negatively diverging from the ideal. If this practice is not remediated at this early stage it may contribute to more serious health issues in the future.

**Study limitations**

It is relevant to note that the proportion of adolescent females found to be overweight (12.3%) and obese (1.3%) in this study differs from the national average (20% & 5.7% respectively).42 This likely reflects the predominant recruitment of participants from areas of above average income (i.e. Sydney’s upper North Shore and private schools on the Central Coast) and is consistent with research by O’Dea showing that families of higher socio-economic status are at reduced risk of obesity.43

Though the proportion of children experiencing obesity may differ in this cohort, the perceptions leading to, and the biological impact of, heavy dieting is likely to be transferable across other population groups. Additionally

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Physiological health marker</th>
<th>Use of weight control techniques</th>
<th>Mean (95% CI)</th>
<th>Min</th>
<th>Max</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BMI (kg/m²)*</td>
<td>Never</td>
<td>20.7 (20.3, 21.2)</td>
<td>15.4</td>
<td>35.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Occasionally</td>
<td>21.9 (21.4, 22.3)</td>
<td>16.8</td>
<td>35.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Often</td>
<td>22.5 (21.5, 23.5)</td>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>31.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waist/hip ratio*</td>
<td>Never</td>
<td>0.77 (0.76, 0.78)</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>0.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Occasionally</td>
<td>0.79 (0.78, 0.80)</td>
<td>0.66</td>
<td>1.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Often</td>
<td>0.80 (0.78, 0.82)</td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td>0.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fat mass (kg)*</td>
<td>Never</td>
<td>13.9 (13.0, 14.7)</td>
<td>1.10</td>
<td>41.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Occasionally</td>
<td>15.9 (15.0, 16.8)</td>
<td>1.60</td>
<td>45.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Often</td>
<td>16.6 (14.6, 18.6)</td>
<td>6.50</td>
<td>36.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muscle mass (kg)*</td>
<td>Never</td>
<td>39.5 (38.9, 40.2)</td>
<td>23.6</td>
<td>51.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Occasionally</td>
<td>41.2 (40.5, 41.8)</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>62.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Often</td>
<td>41.9 (40.7, 43.1)</td>
<td>29.4</td>
<td>51.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fat/muscle ratio*</td>
<td>Never</td>
<td>0.34 (0.33, 0.36)</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>0.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Occasionally</td>
<td>0.38 (0.36, 0.40)</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>1.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Often</td>
<td>0.39 (0.35, 0.43)</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>0.76</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

† Sample distributions: never, n=199; occasionally, n=217 and often, n=54.

* The nonparametric Kruskal-Wallis tests showed that at least one of the medians is statistically significantly different from the other medians for each variable (p<0.01).
while the conclusions from this study are based on blood derived data and appear to be robust the reliance on self-reported information for key study variables is a recognised limitation.

CONCLUSION

Evidence from this study suggests that the use of common weight reduction and weight control techniques by healthy weight adolescent females results in a metabolically identifiable group whose results are consistent with subtle
levels of chronic under-nutrition. This early negative biochemical divergence may predispose these individuals to adverse health outcomes such as osteoporosis, during the later years. These likely consequences highlight the need for education in nutritionally safe dieting practices that ensure adequate nutritional quality.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This study was supported by the Novus Foundation, a community-based charity funding research that promotes adolescent health. The authors also wish to thank the participating schools and students for their enthusiastic cooperation in this study.

AUTHOR DISCLOSURES

Authors have no conflict of interest.

REFERENCES

36. Gibbon RS, Heath ALM, Ferguson EL. Risk of suboptimal iron and zinc nutrition among adolescent girls in Australia


Original Article

Evidence for under-nutrition in adolescent females using routine dieting practices

Jade Guest MPH\textsuperscript{1}, Ayse Bilgin PhD\textsuperscript{2}, Robyn Pearce PhD\textsuperscript{3}, Surinder Baines PhD\textsuperscript{4}, Carol Zeuschner MSc\textsuperscript{5}, Corilda Le Rossignol-Grant DipNursing\textsuperscript{1}, Margaret J Morris PhD\textsuperscript{6}, Ross Grant PhD\textsuperscript{1,6}

\textsuperscript{1}Australasian Research Institute, Sydney Adventist Hospital, NSW, Australia
\textsuperscript{2}Department of Statistics, Macquarie University, NSW, Australia
\textsuperscript{3}Faculty of Education, Avondale College, Cooranbong, NSW, Australia
\textsuperscript{4}School of Health Sciences, Faculty of Health, University of Newcastle, NSW, Australia
\textsuperscript{5}Department of Dietetics, Sydney Adventist Hospital, NSW, Australia
\textsuperscript{6}School of Medical Sciences, Faculty of Medicine, University of New South Wales, Sydney, NSW, Australia

青少女使用一般節食方法所致營養不良的證據

漸增的年輕人肥胖盛行率是西方國家重要的公共衛生議題之一。雖然議題的重點是要減少肥胖，但矛盾的是，這些活動的成功卻可能造成不健康的營養習慣。本研究的目的是調查體重控制方法的使用及其對青春期女性健康的影響。研究對象是澳洲新南威爾斯州的雪梨北部及中部海岸地區中等學校之482位，14至17歲的青少女，檢測她們的生理及生化指標，並以「學校體能活動及營養調查 (SPANS)」的部分問卷收集她們對體重控制方法使用的資料。使用變異數分析法加以比較。過去『經常使用』體重控制方法之參與者，其平均 BMI 為22.5(標準差為3.7)，屬健康的。比較『從未使用』、『偶爾使用』與『經常使用』減重方法的三組參與者之間的血液指標，結果顯示『經常使用』體重控制方法者之血液中有顯著較低的血色素、鹼性磷酸酶、膽色素、白蛋白、總蛋白、血鈣值；但是有較高的肌酸苷及血鉀濃度。這些資料顯示，正常健康體重的青少女使用一般的體重控制方法可能造成代謝的差異，其生化指標顯示輕微的慢性營養不良狀況。

關鍵字：青少年、營養、節食狂熱、身體質量指數、鹼性磷酸酶